

Breaking the Monopoly of Knowledge: Research Methods, Participation and Development

Budd L. Hall

People cannot be developed; they can only develop themselves. For while it is possible for an outsider to build a man's house, an outsider cannot give the man pride and self-confidence in himself as a human being. Those things a man has to create in himself by his own actions. He develops himself by what he does; he develops himself by making his own decisions, by increasing his understanding of what he is doing, and why; by increasing his own knowledge and ability, and by his own full participation — as an equal — in the life of the community he lives in.

(Julius Nyerere, 1973:60)

Research is always and by logical necessity based on moral and political valuations, and the researcher should be obliged to account for them explicitly.

(Gunnar Myrdal, 1970:74)

Background

Thinking about development, adult education and the role of social investigation has undergone dramatic shifts in the recent past. The "top down" concepts of education and development have been widely questioned. Emphasis has shifted from concepts of development based on urbanized expectations to the need to stimulate growth and change in rural areas. The importance and necessity of increased popular involvement in decision making in both rural and urban settings is accepted widely. Development is more and more seen as an awakening process, a process of tapping the creative forces of a much larger proportion of society, a liberating of more persons' efforts instead of a "problem" to be solved by the planners and academicians from afar.

Along with the shift in thinking about development has come a

on in Ujamaa
, 1975, pp. 19-27.

igot-Adholla, S.
in Tanzania. Dar
5.

urvey. Baltimore,

key tasks for
Ministry of Agri-

on of the USAID
University of

n Socialism.

Differentiation
ue of Extension
e Conference of

ica. Dar es

rural development,
rural Development
of Agriculture,

rica/Food and
e Division. A
sion Systems of
sted Guidelines
Ababa; ECA/FAO

general questioning in all fields of social science about the relationship between the way in which research is conducted and the overall values the researcher holds. This discussion within the field of adult education has been particularly rich. There are a growing number of adult education researchers who are exploring new methods. Kathleen Rockhill has suggested that adult educators' search derives from three primary perspectives:

- (1) The concern that quantitative research methods are not providing an adequate understanding of complex reality.
- (2) The desire for 'practical' research that can be used as a base for setting policy and developing programs which will promote social justice and greater self-reliance.
- (3) A humanistic view of human behaviour which sees individuals as active agents in their environments rather than as passive objects to be researched.

(1976:1)

What are the Weaknesses of the Most Commonly Used Research Methods?

If one examines the research in the field of adult education, one would find that 90 per cent of the studies done represent one form or another of the survey research approach. This despite the fact that a vast range of other possible research strategies exist. A number of shortcomings can be identified:

1) The survey research approach oversimplifies social reality and is therefore inaccurate.

In addition to the arbitrariness of instrument construction or the class bias of such specific tools as semantic differential tests and various other tests devised by those who work from a primarily psychological base, these approaches have other weaknesses. A research process that extracts information from individuals in isolation from one another and aggregates this into a single set of figures does so at the expense of reducing the complexity and richness of human experience. Social responses to problems by groups of people are not necessarily the same as the total of individual responses of people acting alone. It is of course correct to say that the use and interpretation of the figures, "depends on the institutional and social context within

which the research is embedded" (Carr-Hill, 1974:30). But even given an institutional framework that encourages popular participation or control of decision making, the representation of population needs by a set of figures such as "22 per cent of those interviewed said that their home environment has had the most influence on their career choice", or "42.16 per cent of teachers report problems", is inadequate, and unsatisfactory. The illusion of accuracy through numbers has been long perpetuated by many of us at least partly as a way of hiding, obscuring or mystifying research.

A second way in which survey research oversimplifies is the perspective of the forced choice. Information is sought through interviews or questionnaires which provide a framework for the responses. For example many questions ask people what is "most influential", "least satisfactory", "first choice" or "most responsible" regarding some specific attitude or decision when attitudes, decisions and behaviour do not reflect a single cause. The curious fact is that all of us have experience of this false choice. We have often filled in forms or questionnaires and have felt the desire to say, "that really isn't the right question". The forced choice approach reaches a fetish point in some educational research as was seen in one case where a "diagnostic tool" was being employed to help in the analysis of new adult students. Potential students of English were asked to choose the one form of literature in which they were most interested from a list that included novels, short stories, poetry, drama or non-fiction. Pity the person who either didn't know the difference between the forms (this is likely enough in modern literature), wanted some of all, or was curious about a specific period.

A third reason why one-time surveys oversimplify is their presentation of a static picture of reality, a photograph of a group of people with neither a past nor a future. The very fact that the survey is ahistorical is a severe limitation; social change is a continuous process, a dialectic or movement from one pole to another over time. The way people respond on one day under one set of conditions by no means guarantees a similar reaction at another time.

2) Survey research is often alienating, dominating or oppressive in character.

If one accepts Freire's point that teaching methods have ideological implications then the same holds true for research methods.

about the
conducted and
ussion within
rich. There
who are ex-
ed that adult
ctives:

hods are
complex

an be
loping
and

sees
ron-
re-

976:1)

Research Methods?

education,
represent
. This
e research
identified:

ial reality

truction or
fferential
work from a
other weak-
on from indi-
s this into
educing the
l responses
the same as
alone. It is
ation of the
ontext within

If one is concerned with increasing people's capacity to participate fully and gain some degree of control over their lives, then research methods themselves can be part of this process. Questionnaires or interviews designed in an office of a university or adult education institution are by nature onesided. This process regards people as sources of information, as having bits of isolated knowledge, but they are neither expected nor apparently assumed able to analyze a given social reality. At the extreme, researchers take up people's time with often badly formulated questions and make interpretations based on little experience in the area or social class the basis of programmes which are then expected to be useful and relevant.

Research approaches of this style often create the illusion among those who are the suppliers of information that research is rigorous, highly technical, scientifically "pure" and that the work can only be done by those who are university trained. The abilities of people to investigate their objective realities are not stimulated and the pool of human creativity is kept within narrow confines. Those most familiar with the problems and whose daily existence is affected by poor health, poor nutrition, low levels of production or past failures of educational provision are effectively taken out of the active process of making the changes which might lead to improvements. Control is left to those who by definition and levels of training are outside the experiences within which change is sought.

3) Survey research does not provide easy links to possible subsequent action.

Much research in adult education is action oriented. It may be an attempt to determine a community's educational needs or an attempt to modify existing programmes through an evaluation/research process. In either case it is expected that when changes are made the people in the community or the participants in the adult education programme will participate more actively, more efficiently or will gain increased benefits over what had existed before. Basic principles of planning stress that the likelihood of full and effective participation in any ventures — education, political or social — are improved by involving would-be participants in the decision-making process. In addition to resulting in a poor source of information, research which has alienated, or at best treated respondents as sources of primitive information, has little likelihood of creating the active and supportive environment essential for change.

4) Survey research methods are not consistent with the principles of adult education.

The arguments put forward so far would apply to a critique or research in social science generally. Within the field of adult education there are additional criteria to be met in selecting a research approach. To begin with, adult education is rooted to a concept of social justice and equality in a way in which other disciplines are not. Concern for the adult learner is often concern for the proportion of the population that has not had, for various reasons, an appropriate share of either national wealth or social services. In Africa, Asia and Latin America, adult education is directly linked to attempts to increase participation of citizens in national development and to provide a minimum level of basic education to all people.

A reading of any or all of the basic adult education texts such as Kidd, Knowles or Miller would produce a set of principles that would most likely include statements such as:

- a) Programmes should be based on adult needs.
- b) Adults, unlike children, are more easily able to articulate their learning needs.
- c) Although there are changes with age in the ways in which adults learn, the phrase "too old to learn" is a fallacy.
- d) Adults work out often quite complex learning strategies to achieve desired goals on their own.

(Kidd, 1974; Knowles, 1971; Miller, 1964).

These principles, and many others, imply a faith in adults as whole persons participating actively in the world. It is no secret that the administration of actual programmes usually falls short of these principles; but such principles do exist and should serve as a basic guide for adult education research. John Holmes has suggested that if educational research had been working with adults instead of children, the concern with methods would have arisen much earlier as some adults at least are not passive and would not be as tolerant as school children and their teachers (1976:150).

Instead, we find that the dominant research methods in use and the ones being picked up as adult educators begin to do more and more research are alienating, inaccurate as a means of identifying needs, and see some adults as marginal or incapable of

articulating their own needs. Research in adult education is at an early stage of development. Within this specialization we still have time to select research approaches that suit us uniquely and thereby keep us one step ahead of other social sciences now going through the throes of discarding an anti-quarian pursuit.

Alternative Strategies

Some work has been done on finding an alternative approach. A general dissatisfaction with orthodox approaches has been expressed in the work of Mead and Blumer (Blumer, 1969). Qualitative, as opposed to quantitative, strategies have made their strongest entry with Glaser and Strauss, in The Discovery of Grounded Theory (1967). Filstead's introduction in Qualitative Methodology provides a useful discussion substantiating the need for alternatives (1970). Pilsworth and Ruddock have described an alternative approach based on a phenomenological position (1975:33). Still other approaches have borrowed from anthropology and stress the value of participant observation (McCall and Simmons, 1969). Beltran has outlined convincingly the western bias in social science research methods (1976). Helen Callaway has similarly singled out the cultural trap which researchers are prey to when attempting allegedly objective research in non-western cultures (1976).

From Africa comes the work of Swantz and in some sense Malya with his approach to providing follow-up literacy material and investigation of a literacy environment (Swantz, 1974a, 1974b; Malya, 1975). In Latin America, Freire provides useful ideas in chapter three of Pedagogy of the Oppressed and a bit more in a talk given to the Institute of Adult Education in Tanzania (1971, 1973). Vio describes some attempts at peasant participation in Chile under the Allende government (1975:70). Beltran and Gerace have developed important concepts of communication among peasants rather than to them (Beltran, 1976; Gerace, 1973). These concepts of "horizontal communication" are important links. In addition to Freire, Pinto has elaborated the forms of thematic investigation (1969). Within the field of sociology, the Olivieras have put forward a compelling set of similar ideas in The Militant Observer: A Sociological Alternative (1975).

Participatory Research

The combination of community participation in decision making

with met
particip
several
persons
The term
tradition
data (wic
There is
tries wit
to work
test some
been put

- 1) A res
a com
an ac

Resea
lectu
tant
resul
means
as a
more
proce
repor
and
impor
produ
advan
ding
memb

- 2) A res
in the
proble
inter

Here
partic
ture
ments
based
in wh
the re
to be

with methods of social investigation results in the concept of participatory research. The term refers to the efforts along several lines to develop research approaches which involve those persons who are the expected "beneficiaries" of the research. The term deliberately focuses on involvement of those who are traditionally the "researched" in formulation, collection of data (widely interpreted) and interpretation of information. There is on-going work by about 80 researchers in several countries with the support of the ICAE participatory research team to work further in both formal and informal ways to outline and test some of these concepts. Some of the guidelines which have been put forward to date are:

- 1) A research process can be of immediate and direct benefit to a community (as opposed to serving merely as the basis for an academic paper or obscure policy analysis).

Research cannot be justified solely as the basis for intellectual exercise or academic career building. It is important that the community or population gain not only from the results of the research, but from the process itself. This means, for example, that villagers or city dwellers should—as a result of participating in the research process—be more able to articulate problems themselves and to initiate processes to find solutions. In more concrete terms, the reports of the youth research in Tanzania by Swantz (1974b) and the agrarian reform work in Chile (Vio, 1975) stress the importance of the entire research team contributing to the productive work of the area. Such an approach has the added advantage of creating a better working atmosphere and providing a closer involvement with the community for the outside members of a research team.

- 2) A research process should involve the community or population in the entire research project from the formulation of the problem to the discussion of how to seek solutions and the interpretation of the findings.

Here we come to what is perhaps the fundamental principle of participatory research and its point of most radical departure from both orthodox research approaches and such improvements as grounded theory. The research process should be based on a system of discussion, investigation and analysis in which the researched are as much a part of the process as the researcher. Theories are neither developed beforehand to be tested nor drawn by the researcher from his or her

education is at
alization we
t suit us
her social
ng an anti-

approach. A
has been ex-
969). Qualita-
made their
discovery of
in Qualitative
lating the need
ave described
il position
from anthropol-
on (McCall and
r the western
elen Callaway
researchers
search in non-

sense Malya
material and
974a, 1974b;
seful ideas in
it more in a
Tanzania (1971,
ticipation in
tran and Gerace
among peasants
. These con-
links. In
of thematic
gy, the Oli-
r ideas in
(1975).

sion making

involvement with reality. Reality is described by the process through which a community develops its own theories and solutions about itself.

- 3) The research process should be seen as part of a total educational experience which serves to establish community needs, and increase awareness and commitment within the community.

Research of this nature could be seen as a natural part of the educational planning or development planning process. It could be an accepted method of raising interest and increasing motivation rather than as a by-product of a research project which might or might not be picked up, depending on the circumstances surrounding the project.

- 4) The research process should be viewed as a dialectic process, a dialogue over time and not as a static picture from one point in time.

Roy Carr-Hill makes a compelling case for using questionnaires as consciousness raising instruments (1974). His point is that precisely because questionnaires are biased they can be used positively to create an awareness and to awaken in individuals powers of analysis which can then be brought to bear on the problem. I would agree with this point, but would want to make certain that in a participatory research process several additional aspects are made clear. The first is that the questionnaire represents only the first stage of the analysis, the basis for several discussions and interactions with the respondents. Secondly, that the interpretation of the questionnaire data is also shared and is not done solely by a single social scientist. Thirdly, one would want any action based on the research process to be arrived at by more than a social scientist and his or her bureaucratic counterparts. The one-time questionnaires, even in the hands of someone who is "pro-people", remains a static and limited tool. It does represent a way of arousing initial interest in a social problem, especially in industrialized societies where community and group interaction is extremely limited.

- 5) The object of the research process, like the object of the educational process, should be the liberation of human creative potential and the mobilization of human resources for the solution of social problems.

This statement is a value, an underlying assumption for participatory research which will not suit everyone. But then this type of research will not perhaps be acceptable to a number of people in any case. The focus of research, learning and socio-economic development should be the same — man. The more intellectual power and creativity that can be brought to bear on society, the more likely a solution. We need not more highly trained and sophisticated researchers operating with ever more esoteric techniques, but whole neighbourhoods, communities and nations of "researchers".

An analogy to medicine is appropriate here. Social science research often appears to produce a situation in which a medical doctor tries to diagnose a patient's symptoms from around the corner and out of sight. The social scientist uses his "instruments" to measure the response of the patient as though they were a king of long stethoscope. The focus of the researcher has been on developing a better and better stethoscope for going around corners and into houses when the real need is for the researcher to walk around the corner, go into the house and begin talking with the people who live there.

6) A research process has ideological implications.

There are two points involved here: First is the re-affirmation of the political nature of all we do especially in adult education. Knowledge is power. A research process which allows for popular involvement and increased capacities of analysis may also make new political actions possible. At the same time it may be necessary at a certain time for the researcher to choose one group or another within the community to work with. The use of the term "participatory research" will not prevent someone from using similar methods to help a group of landlords work out a set of "tenant-tight" rules and living arrangements. It may be necessary to make the choice to work only for the tenants at an early stage. What is reality for landlords and perhaps even some government officials is not reality for tenants.

Conclusion

We have created and are still creating a situation in social science research which effectively denies recognition of knowledge creating abilities in most of the people of the world. In

described by the pro-
fessional theories and

of a total edu-
cational community needs,
in the community.

natural part of
the learning process.
interest and incu-
pation of a research
group, depending on

dialectic process,
structure from one

using questionnaires
. His point is
biased they can be
to awaken in in-
terest be brought to
his point, but
participatory research
is clear. The first
is the first stage of
learning and inter-
action at the interpret-
ed and is not
Thirdly, one would
expect to be arrived
at by her bureau-
crats, even in
remains a static
of arousing initia-
tion in industrialized
education is extremely

the object of the
creation of human crea-
tive resources for

our search for ways of adding to the "body of knowledge" we have lost sight of the objectives of our work. For persons working in participatory research the importance of keeping a firm eye on one's values is crucial. Science is not a bag of tricks that one learns by being trained at ever increasing degrees of detachment from reality. We have created an illusion that we have come to believe ourselves; that only those with sophisticated techniques can create knowledge.

Participatory research is not a set of ideas that can be applied at random with predictable results. It is not neat, it cannot be rounded off to two decimal points and it is even difficult to make into charts. It does not eliminate the need to constantly evaluate political implications of one's work. What it does for those of us in adult education is to offer an alternative way of thinking about research which may suit both the needs of our work and our own values more closely.

REFERENCES

- Adiseshiah, M.A. (1976) Valedictory Address, International Conference of Adult Education and Development, ICAE, Dar es Salaam, Tanzania, June.
- Asian Action (1976) Newsletter of the Asian Cultural Forum on Development, 4 May-June.
- Beltran, L.R. (1976) Alien premises, objects, and methods in Latin American communication research, Communication Research, Vol. 3, No. 2, April, 107-134.
- Blackburn, R. (ed.) (1972) Ideology in Social Science. London, Fontana.
- Blumer, H. (1969) Symbolic Interactionism. Englewood Cliffs, N.J., Prentice-Hall.
- Bodenheimer, S.J. (no date) The ideology of developmentalism: American political science's paradigm-surrogate for Latin American studies, Berkeley Journal of Sociology, 95-137.
- Buttedahl, P.G. and Buttedahl, K. (1976) Participation: The Transformation of Society and the Peruvian Experience, Convergence, Vol. 9, No. 3, pp. 16-26.

- Callaway, H. (1976) Research for Development: Adult Learners within their cultural setting, presented at Conference on Adult Education for Development, Dar es Salaam, June.
- Carr-Hill, R. (1974) Developing Educational Services for the Needs of Population Groups: testing some concepts (mimeo, Paris: UNESCO - E.P.P.), June.
- Colletta, N.J. (1976) Participatory Research or participation put-down? Reflections on an Indonesian experiment in non-formal education, Convergence, Vol. 9, No. 3, pp. 32-46.
- Draper, J. (1977) Research and Community, an Ojibway Case Study, in Hall, B.L. and Gillette, A., Participatory Research: An Approach for Change (forthcoming).
- Economic Development Bureau, Inc. (1976) Appropriate technology for grain storage in Tanzanian villages (preliminary report).
- Filstead, W.J. (1970) Qualitative Methodology. Chicago, Markham.
- Fordham, P., Poulton, G. and Randle, L. (1975) A question of participation: Action and research in the New Communities Project, Convergence, Vol. 8, No. 2, pp. 54-69.
- Freire, P. (1971) Pedagogy of the Oppressed. London, Penguin.
- Freire, P. (1974) Research Methods, Literacy Discussion, Spring.
- Gaynor, M.G. and Gaynor, E. (1976) Bibliographical compilation concerning "participation" in work organizations and in educational contexts in Peru, prepared for Conference on Adult Education for Development, ICAE, Dar es Salaam, June.
- Gaynor, E. and Gaynor, M.G. (1975) A study of the effects of workers' participation in agricultural co-operatives involved in an adult education program in Peru, Department of International Studies in Education, Michigan State University.
- Gerace, F. (1973) Comunicacion Horizontal. Lima, Libreria.
- Glaser, B.G. and Strauss, A.L. (1967) The Discovery of Grounded Theory. Chicago, Aldine.
- Guttierrez, F. (1976) Creativity through cultural activity, paper presented at NORSECA seminar on adult education, Costa

f knowledge" we have
or persons working
keeping a firm eye
a bag of tricks that
ing degrees of detach-
ion that we have come
sophisticated tech-

that can be applied
ot neat, it cannot
is even difficult to
need to constantly
c. What it does for
an alternative way of
the needs of our work

International Com-
it, ICAE, Dar es

Cultural Forum on

, and methods in
Communication Re-

l Science. London,

Englewood Cliffs,

developmentalism:
rogate for Latin
ology, 95-137.

Participation: The
n Experience,

Rica, August 10.

- Hall, B.L. (1975) Participatory Research: An approach for change, Convergence, Vol. 8, No. 2, pp. 24-32.
- Holmes, J. (1976) Thoughts on Research Methodology in Studies in Adult Education, Vol. 8, No. 2, October.
- Kennedy, T. (1973) The Sky River Project: The Story of a process, Access, Challenge for Change (National Film Board of Canada), Summer.
- Kidd, J.R. (1974) How Adults Learn, 2nd edition. New York, Association Press.
- Knowles, M. (1971) The Modern Practice of Adult Education. New York, Seabury Press.
- Lindsey, J.K. (1976) Participatory Research: Some comments, Convergence, Vol. 9, No. 3, pp. 47-50.
- Lotz, J. (1976) Whatever happened to community development, Canadian Welfare, 52, pp. 5-8.
- Malya, S. (1975) Tanzania's Literacy Experience, Literacy Discussion, Spring, pp. 45-68.
- Marsick, V.J. (1976) Grounded Theory: A research strategy for analyzing programs of non-formal development education, University of California at Los Angeles, Berkeley.
- McCall, G. and Simmons, J.L. (1969) Issues in Participant Observation. Reading, Mass., Addison-Wesley.
- Miller, H. (1964) Teaching and Learning in Adult Education. New York, McMillan.
- Myrdal, G. (1970) Objectivity in Social Research. London, Duckworth.
- Nyerere, J.K. (1973) Freedom and Development. Dar es Salaam, Oxford University Press.
- Ohliger, J. and Niemi, J. (1975) Annotated and quotational bibliography on participatory research, Convergence, Vol. 8, No. 2, pp. 82-87.

- Oliveira, R.E.M. (1975) The Militant Observer: A Sociological Alternative. Geneva, IDAC.
- Pilsworth, M. and Ruddock, R. (1975) Some criticisms of survey research methods in adult education, Convergence, Vol. 8, No. 2, pp. 25-33.
- Pinto, J.B. (1969) Metodologia de la investigacion tematica. Bogota, IICA-CIDA, No. 101.
- Puerta, I. and Bruce, R.L. (1972) Data collection with low-income respondents, Department of Education, Cornell University.
- Reed, D. (1975) The militant observer: Redefining the role of the social scientist, Institute for Documentation of Cultural Action, Geneva.
- Ribeiro, L. (1975) A village scenario: Action research in Goa, World Education Reports, No. 10, December.
- Rockhill, K. (1976) The uses of qualitative research in adult education to "enlighten, enoble and enable", Department of Education, University of California, Los Angeles.
- Rockhill, K. (1975) Alternatives for adults: Education for individual and social change. Graduate School of Education, University of California, Los Angeles.
- Rogers, E.M. (1976) Communication and Development: The passing of the dominant paradigm, Communication Research, Vol. 3, No. 2, April, pp. 213-225.
- Swantz, M. (1974a) Participant Role of Research in Development (mimeo), Dar es Salaam, BRALUP.
- Swantz, M. (1974b) Youth and Development in the Coast Region of Tanzania, Dar es Salaam, BRALUP Research Report No. 6.
- Swantz, M.L. (1975) Research as an educational tool for development, Convergence, Vol. 8, No. 2, pp. 44-53.
- Tate, S. (1973) Anthropological perspectives on evaluation in development education, Interchange, Vol. 4, No. 4.
- Vanek, J. (1975) and Bayard, T., Education toward self-management:

An alternative development strategy, International Development Review, 4, pp. 17-23.

Vio, F. (1976) Participation, Education and Agricultural Reform in Chile, paper presented at Conference on Adult Education for Development, Sar es Salaam, June.

Young, M.F.D. (1975) The ideology of educational research, Times Higher Education Supplement, Jan. 17.

Zuniga, R.B. (1974) The experimenting society and radical social reform: The role of the social scientist in Chile's Unidad Popular experience, paper presented at American Psychological Association convention, September 1, New Orleans.

Adult Education

The past decade has seen a number of ideas and practices in meeting the needs of the adult population brought forth. These have concentrated on adult education to encourage the individual to solve his own problems, to form the most relevant groups to share their experiences (with other nations). A new renewal of culture from what now exists within a wider framework of closely related

But, in contrast to the current emphasis on adult education. A most part has been following such a path of choice questions set out the categories. The most automatic. Only a few of the usual practices) designed for a beginner question whether are always next stages of an often been as if the more than mature acting and invest their